Philippi Horticultural Area
A City asset or potential development node?

Summary Report

A report commissioned by Rooftops Canada Foundation Inc. – Foundation Abri International in partnership with the African Food Security Urban Network.

Dr Jane Battersby-Lennard and Gareth Haysom

April 2012
This report has been drafted as a result of work carried out by a number of researchers, each contributing specific case studies and research reports to the process. These researchers included: Dr Jane Battersby Lennard, Gareth Haysom, Jess Rattle and Frances Davies. The research report has been drafted by Dr Jane Battersby Lennard and Gareth Haysom (corresponding author).

A project of Rooftops Canada - Abri International, undertaken with the financial support of the Government of Canada provided through the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) in partnership with the African Food Security Urban Network (AFSUN).

The opinions expressed in the report are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the African Food Security Urban Network, Rooftops Canada - Abri International, the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), the Sustainability Institute, the African Centre for Cities or the University of Cape Town.

Contact: Gareth Haysom
African Food Security Urban Network
African Centre for Cities
Engeo Building, Upper Campus
University of Cape Town
Tel: +27 21 650 5903
Email: gareth.haysom@uct.ac.za
Web: www.afsun.org
Introduction

The City of Cape Town faces a unique challenge, one not faced by any other city or urban management area in South Africa. The challenge is one of seeking ways to manage and administer a large portion of land, land carrying rural status, located within the immediate urban environment, within an area of significant poverty and need, namely the Cape Flats.

This pressure is further compounded by a lack of current and accessible information about the viability, sustainability or potential of the area. Due to the nature of production and complex links between the Philippi Horticultural Area (PHA) and the food system of the City of Cape Town, the challenge of the Philippi Horticultural Area is of importance to more than the specific Philippi stakeholders, but to a far broader group of Cape Town and regional stakeholders, as this report will demonstrate.

Decisions about the area have far broader implications, implications that could undermine livelihood strategies and resilience of a far wider set of stakeholders. This challenge is made all the more urgent by an increase in requests for zoning changes and land use departures within the PHA. The dynamic mix between what is argued to be a viable food production area\(^1\), perceptions of an opportunity for potential housing developments for those living in informality\(^2\) and need, an opportunity for developers to capitalise on strategically located land\(^3\), and conflicting perspectives of what is urban or non urban and what is part of the city landscape and what is not, adds to the tensions and ongoing debates about the PHA, its value, viability and status in the longer term.

This report is a summary of a larger and more detailed report on the PHA.

Report focus

The primary focus of this report is on the role of the Philippi Horticultural Area in the Cape Town food system. Regardless of the multiple needs and perspectives on the Philippi Horticultural Area (see figure 1), the area is first and foremost a food production area, one with a long history of food production, a history dating back to the mid 1800’s\(^4\), and even earlier\(^5\). This research sought to assess the importance of the Philippi Horticultural Area in terms of its overall value to the entire Cape Town food system. While mentioned as secondary information, citing specific specialist reports, this report does not engage directly in the other aspects pertaining to the PHA such as sand mining, aquifer management nor the technical merits, or lack thereof, of housing within the area. These aspects are beyond this research brief and skills of the authors of this report.

Previous assessments of the PHA have not taken an explicit food lens. It is argued that a number of the previous reports, primarily those motivating for certain developments within the area, have implicitly argued, or, due to the focus of the reports, created (although not necessarily intentionally) a view that the food value of this area is negligible\(^6\) and that the broader globalised South African food system would cover any slack created by the loss of this area. This report sought to understand

---

\(^1\) Informed by research findings and volume off-take. Also Van der Westhuisen, 2012.
\(^2\) Pollack, M. 2008
\(^3\) As evidenced by the land use departure requests. Also included as part of the CoCT dept of Housing submission to Joint PEPCO and Housing Com 12.05.09
\(^4\) Rabe, L, 1992
\(^5\) Pula, 26 April
\(^6\) For example, submission by MSP for the area in the South Eastern section of the PHA.
the current PHA/Cape Town food system relationship, the opportunities and challenges that this
offered, the beneficiaries of this system and other potential but previously ignored values and
challenges presented by the PHA.

In the context of the PHA, it was also necessary to investigate the local and PHA based flows and
systems at work within the area “footprint”. The research sought to assess and understand the net
of beneficiaries emanating from the PHA system, questioning the broader set of consumers within
the Cape Town region, who these consumers would be and what would the consequences be, both
locally and within the broader system, if this food source was removed from the food chain.

The research found that these questions are essential as the PHA and its systems are generally
misunderstood. These misunderstandings inhibit effective engagement in the area and result in
confusion as to how current decisions specific to the area should be made. More importantly this
misunderstanding creates significant confusion and contestation in terms of what the future of the
area should be in the context of broader Cape Town development plans and processes. These
conflicting narratives, perceptions and views as to use, viability and necessity all converge to create a
sense that this is an area in crisis with little value in its current state.

This research found that this perception was untrue and misinformed. The research found
the PHA to be an area of high cultural, social and ecological significance. The area was
found to have a variety of areas of critical heritage importance, even uncovering reports
of recent discoveries of Khoisan artefacts in the PHA. This fact appears in no documentation
about the PHA.

Although previously documented, ecologically, the importance of the Cape Flats Aquifer, to
food production, the preservation of access and the recharge of this resource, highlighted the
links between a variety of anthropocentric and ecosystem service relationships.

Reviewed reports indicated viable and sustainable use of this ecological resource, while calling for monitoring and management systems. The importance of the Cape Flats Aquifer and the relationship between this, the land, the city as a whole and climate change, were found to be of critical importance, particularly in the context of the links between food production, food prices and the building of climate related resilience.

---

7 Ericksen’s (2007) depiction of the food system used in research process and included Food System Drivers, Activities and Outcomes.
8 For example claims that the PHA is no longer productive, the farmers all want to sell, agriculture is damaging the water table, etc.
9 City of Cape Town, 2007
10 Interview with farmer, Mr George, 26 April 2012
11 Parsons, 2009.
12 Map provided by City of Cape Town, Directorate of Spatial Planning.
Research methodology

The research methodology applied three core strategies. The first strategy entailed the review of existing written reports and publications linked to the PHA. Secondly, alternative data sets were reviewed and assessed. These sets included, for example, data on the off-take from the PHA through the Cape Town Fresh Produce Market (CTFPM)\(^\text{13}\). Lastly, a contextual understanding of the broader area was sought through a process of key informant interviews across sectors and stakeholders. These stakeholders included emerging smallholder farmers, large scale farmers, store owners in the area and traders whose product is derived from the area, directly or indirectly. These interviews were further supported by a process of immersion into certain place-based processes and activities.

Philippi Horticultural Area findings

Currently the general perspective offered by certain city officials\(^\text{14}\), the broader public and certain commentators on the area\(^\text{15}\), is that the PHA is an area with declining production and disgruntled farmers who are simply waiting for the best price for their land before selling\(^\text{16}\). This view was not supported in the research findings.

The research noted increases in production, new land being farmed and significant investments in infrastructure being made on the part of the farmers, by both the larger scale farmers and by the new emerging smallholder farmers\(^\text{17}\). The area produces well over 50 different horticultural crops and many farmers are also active in livestock production. The farmers have realigned their production to new markets and market systems and are now actively selling direct to the major retailers, retailer agents and other sources such as restaurants and speciality stores. Farmers are also actively involved in on-farm value addition\(^\text{18}\).

While estimating production figures is arguably subjective, it was estimated that just under 100 000 tonnes of fresh produce is grown in the PHA annually\(^\text{19}\). This included an estimated figure of over 2 000 tonnes of produce that is given free to farm workers in a year\(^\text{20}\) - a flow of food that plays a critical role in the broader food access of the communities in the vicinity of the PHA. All this has been achieved on the back of innovative and proactive farm management strategies. These strategies are further supported by an endogenous economic system. This is a highly specialised system designed to be mutually supportive of a number of farm based and off-farm economies, and services all farmers in the PHA. Active within the area are seedling suppliers, input suppliers such as fertiliser and infrastructure suppliers and other input suppliers such as compost producers; food chain interventions such as beneficiation and wholesalers, packhouses and transportation suppliers.

---

\(^\text{13}\) This data was provided by CTFPM and included PHA throughput between April 2011 and March 2012.
\(^\text{14}\) For example articulations of the PHA offered by housing officials in processes leading to PEPCO 2009 meetings on the PHA
\(^\text{15}\) This is a general discourse and reflects views offered by a number of Cape Town residents offered to the researchers in informal conversations about the PHA.
\(^\text{16}\) As per PEPCO meeting, 2009, Van der Westhuisen, 2012. Some farmers, particularly those with poor access to water or on farms whose size makes production difficult may fall into this camp but these do not account for the majority of the land under production.
\(^\text{17}\) These processes were confirmed in the interview processes and by on site observation and confirmed by Van der Westhuisen, 2012
\(^\text{18}\) Informed by farmer interviews and research process
\(^\text{19}\) Figure informed by interviews with farmers and farmer’s association. Calculated on estimated through put to CTFPM and interviews with farmers to ascertain the percentage of their crops sold to the CTFPM (≤15%).
\(^\text{20}\) Informed by farmer interviews, calculated on estimated 15kgs per employee per week multiplied by 3000 employees factoring in horticultural land use and temporary employment cycles.
All these activities reflect an integrated and mutually beneficial set of economic systems that add economic integrity to the area. These systems all have linkages beyond the PHA.

In respect of the broader economic system, the research found that the increasing pressures imposed on the global food system reverberate through local food systems. These pressures are compounded by crises beyond the control of local food system actors. These crises include climate driven food shortages elsewhere in the world that impact on the local food supply, shifts in diet driven by rapid developing world urbanisation, and most critically, significant increases in the oil price and thus price increases in all industries and systems reliant on oil. The PHA allows for control at the local scale, buffering communities from these crises and providing resilience from the associated shocks.

**Philippi Horticultural Area challenges**

While the farmers are generally positive about the opportunities in the PHA, there is significant frustration at the confusion about the future of the area. This frustration is compounded by a real challenge of continuous theft of farming infrastructure and increasingly large scale theft of produce. The challenge of theft is made worse by ineffective control in the area, aggravated by reports, from all farmers, of ineffective and selective police services in the area. These challenges are further aggravated by the constant debate as to the future of the PHA, and as a result the future of the farms and all support operations. Regardless of these challenges, farmers remain active and engaged in the business of farming.

**The Philippi Horticultural Area in the broader Cape Town Food System**

The PHA was found to be playing a critical role in the broader food security within the settlements adjacent to the PHA. Informed by reported flows of food from the PHA, retail networks that source the bulk of their product from the PHA and due to the food distribution networks in place, there is real potential for fresher and nutritionally dense food to flow into these communities. It was also reported that while food prices do not necessarily differ when compared to food prices from other production areas, should the produce from the PHA be removed from the distribution system, there is a real risk of significantly higher food prices for all items currently grown in the PHA. Certain farmers interviewed suggested that currently the PHA plays a key role in moderating prices for all soft leaf green vegetable types, regardless of source.

The areas surrounding the PHA experience high levels of food insecurity. This research argues that in the absence of the PHA, this challenge would be significantly worse. This research found a definite case arguing the importance of the PHA to food security specifically, and to a more resilient food economy, more generally. Additional review is required in order to effectively assess the scale and influence that the PHA has in the local food economy and how these flows of food impact on the livelihoods and general food security of the members of the communities surrounding the PHA.

---

21 This was an issue raised by every farmer interviewed as well as suppliers and other stakeholders in the area
22 Here the report is specifically referring to the farmers who are interested in remaining in the PHA and have invested in their farms.
24 Ibid
more work is required in this field and specifically in respect of the role of a number of components within the food system, for example, livestock production and its use within the communities.

A review was carried out, interviewing a number of food sales outlets selling fresh produce in the vicinity of the PHA. These outlets included street traders, spaza shops, farmstalls, small wholesalers and traders operating outside established retail stores. For certain stores, specifically the farmstalls and certain street traders, the PHA is the primary source of vegetable produce. However, for many of the other retail outlets, food travels from the PHA, through various other market mechanisms (such as the People’s Market in Epping) before being sold by these stores. This reflects the complexity of the food system but research found that the PHA played a key role in these processes.

The research also engaged with a new and active group of committed emerging smallholder farmers actively seeking ways to establish themselves in the PHA farming community – a number of whom are already established. Most of these farmers have identified alternative markets and reflect the market opportunities that remain for fresh produce and other agricultural products, particularly their already identified market of the ethical and local consumer. These farmers are also enabling access to a number of other low income customers, some of whom are able to access food from these farmers at far lower prices, and at times at no cost, enabling a variety of survivalist food access strategies on the part of communities adjacent to the PHA. These farmers see their roles as farmers differently and while they currently engage in multiple livelihood strategies in order to make a success of their farming operations, they are investing significantly in the land and in their communities. These farmers represent a new view of the area, linking other services provided by the area to their immediate communities. These activities include nature based excursions for specific groups, school outings, certain remedial activities and educational interventions. These activities, linked to challenges experienced in the source communities of these groups, indicates a far more nuanced set of values associated with the PHA.

This finding reflects the potential opportunity of the PHA. This cadre of committed urban farmers have shown both great interest, made significant investment in the PHA and are generating multiple benefits, although small, at this time. This learning offers opportunities to other such farmers wanting to enter the area. This entry remains a challenge though and if land prices are to be set at an anticipated development potential cost; this would exclude the entry of such farmers. For the full potential to be realised, two key aspects are required: That the PHA is zoned as rural and the rural, agricultural land use status upheld, and secondly, that there is appropriate and dedicated support provided to these farmers from all public entities mandated to provide such support. This support needs to be aligned to the contextual realities of the PHA and the PHA farming systems.

From a broader food security and city food system perspective, the research has found that while the majority of the produce cultivated, and the livestock reared, on the PHA enters more general markets, the food that is retained within the local economy has significant value to that economy from both a financial and food security perspective. The localised food economies active as a result of the PHA feed multiple channels and are all mutually supportive. It is argued that should the PHA be removed from this process, while the market mechanisms would ensure that food would be

---

26 This group consisted of 7 new farmers, 2 of whom are land reform recipients while the others have purchased land with their own funds. All are investing significantly in the land, both financially and through own labour.
available within the system, this would be at a far higher cost to the city and in particular to the poor and vulnerable within the city.

Notions of an area in decline are false, the Philippi Horticultural Areas is a key production zone

This research demonstrated a number of critical aspects pertinent to the PHA. Primarily, the research has allowed for the emergence of a more recent picture of the PHA, one that counters a number of other narratives about the PHA, narratives that argued that the area was in decline. This research has found that this is certainly not the case. A further narrative that has been debunked is the notion that the commercial farmers are simply waiting for offers from developers and will then leave the land as they are old and their children are not interested in farming. This is certainly not the case with a number of farmers, larger scale and emerging smallholder, investing heavily in the land and actively working to improve the areas viability and their livelihoods. A number of the farmers are young, two of whom were under the age of 30 and see the area as having a real future (conditional of a number of institutional certainties). A further narrative was that the net levels of agricultural production are declining. This was certainly found to be untrue and while levels of produce through the CTFPM are certainly declining, off-take from the farms is increasing as new markets are identified and engaged with directly by the farmers.

The farmers reviewed, although extremely frustrated at institutional challenges, poor policing and zoning concerns, see themselves as playing a long term role in the PHA. A number of the farmers cited a 30 year horizon. While certain farmers have left the land, these farm areas are not idle, they have been purchased by the current farmers who are growing their land holdings in order to respond to external input price pressures, but also to position themselves to respond to the emerging markets into which they now supply.

All farmers require certainty as to the future of the Philippi Horticultural Area

While the general views of the PHA are positive, these are constrained by extreme frustration at the fact that the area is not protected, secured and resourced as an agricultural zone. The numerous zoning request changes and the fact that there is clear disagreement on the part of officials as to the future of the area, precipitating more requests for change, is a cause of great frustration. The overwhelming request from all the farmers is for certainty and clarity as to the future of the PHA. Most of the farmers interviewed in this process, larger scale and emerging, are not planning or even aspiring to move from the PHA. Many farmers have invested significantly in their farming operations and even if they were to be bought out at this time, this would not cover their investments.

---

27 It should be noted that while certain farmers, particularly those on less productive land, would certainly accept financial offers made for their land, in the main, the established farmers who are driving the resurgence of the area remain committed to farming and further, the levels of investment in the land and resultant financing would mean that land prices would need to be significantly higher than currently offered (even by prospective developers) for these farmers to move (Rix, 2012; Horstmann, 2012)
28 Fehlmann and L Rix Jr
29 Confirmed by CTFPM PHA offtake document comparison 2009 and 2012
30 Rix, 2012 and Horstmann, 2012
31 Particularly MSP in 2009 and Headline Partners (Pty) Ltd (Provincial Gazette, Number 6951)
The PHA in the context of agricultural zones within the Cape Metropolitan Area

The perspective of the value of the PHA has been informed by a number of narratives, oftentimes deliberately aligned to undermine the value of the area. However, following the City of Cape Town’s own research, the 2008 Agricultural Land Report\(^\text{32}\), it was found that when compared with all the other farming areas falling under the auspices of the City of Cape Town and Cape Metropolitan Area, the PHA was found to be of significant importance. The PHA was found to be of far greater importance overall when compared to other areas within the CMA and was rated as fourth overall (and only 0.02% below the 3\(^\text{rd}\) rated area, Philadelphia (figure 2)). In assessing the agricultural zones within the CMA, the Agricultural Land Report of 2008 reviewed 5 Areas of Significance. The PHA scored above average on 3 of the 5 areas of significance (figure 3) and while it scored lower than average for Environmental Significance, a review of the Cape Flats Aquifer and the positive relationship between the CFA and the PHA in 2009\(^\text{33}\) would potentially alter this finding, providing greater scores to the PHA in the area of environmental significance. Coupled with the findings from the farmer reviews and the assessment of the value that the PHA offers the city, this research strongly suggests that any plans to remove the PHA from the food system require serious reconsideration. The PHA is a valuable asset to the city and should be retained. In order to do this the area needs to be secured in accordance with all the means available to the city and the province.

![Figure 2: Rating of CoCT agricultural areas as per the 2008 Agricultural Land Report](image)

![Figure 3: PHA vs Average Area of Significance Scores](image)

When considering the future of the PHA, the generalised and often used assessment of value excludes a number of intrinsic and other value assertions, thus labelling the PHA as an area of less value than other CMA agri-zones. This is a fundamentally flawed assertion and is incorrect.

The PHA is a key city resource that contributes in a significant way to building both longer term urban food resilience but critically, climate resilience. The PHA is a critical component in any assertion of Cape Town being a sustainable city. Removal of the area would undermine not just livelihoods, food security and a culturally important area, removal of the PHA, even in part, would fundamentally erode any notion of Cape Town as a sustainable city.

\(^{32}\) CoCT – ALR, 2008.

\(^{33}\) Parsons, 2009.
Due to the PHA geography, production takes place at a greater scale but also spans the seasons. This fact is a critical benefit. There are times of year when other agri-zones, both within the CMA and even nationally, are removed from production due to water scarcity, climate, heat, cold, etc. This does not apply to the PHA and contributes to price normalisation but more importantly, to a continual and consistent supply of food items (see figure 4 for a detail of the Cape based dynamics).

![Figure 4: Climatic zones and distances to other markets](image)

**Employment**

This research process found a general trend of high labour usage with an average of 2.5 full time workers per ha and an additional 1.5 temporary workers per ha in the months from December to the end of April. Using the estimated land area used for horticultural production of 940ha, this would translate to 2 350 full time employees and 1 410 part time employees, a total of 3 760 job opportunities from the horticultural businesses alone. If this figure is broken down further, this would translate into an estimated 2 630 jobs allocated to female workers (at 70 percent of workforce calculation). Specific farms do make use of labour in different ways and as such, this figure should be read as a potential employment estimate. In calculating employment, a more conservative number (supported by the EESP 2012 report) was applied resulting in an estimate of 2 000 full time employees, translating into net per annum wages of R 36 000 000 for full time employees and R 7 500 000 for part time employees (1 000 employees), a total wage opportunity of R 43 500 000. If other mandatory (leave, sick pay, etc) and non mandatory benefits (loans, etc) are

---

34 Horstmann, 2012  
35 Kleynhans, T. 2009  
36 Calculated on a 75/25 percent split of land use between horticultural and livestock production – an estimate confirmed by farmers through the interviews process.  
37 CoCT, 2012, EESP Directorate and Van der Westhuisen, 2009  
38 CoCT, 2012, EESP Presentation on the PHA  
39 All figures calculated using DOL minimum agricultural wage and confirmed by farmer interviews (externally verified by retailers in traceability processes of supplier appointment)
calculated, this figure will further increase. A further trend is that there does also appear to be a distinct shift, one that runs contrary to current market trends - that of increasing the full time (permanent) staff compliment.

Farmers reported that the majority of employees were women, many of them having only basic education and many only speaking isiXhosa. However, on certain farms it was reported that while this had been the trend, the shortage of employment opportunities within the region has resulted in most temporary workers now having a grade 12 certificate.

The smallscale emerging farmers draw on labour from local communities and pay according to legal requirements but are actively seeking to develop the staff within their operations. Furthermore, all emerging farmers expressed a desire to ensure as many full time employment opportunities as possible. This desire is further supported by the farming style, that of using more labour and less, or no, external inputs.

The general trend is that staff employed in the PHA are from neighbouring communities including Crossroads, Philippi and Browns Farm and Samora Machel, specifically, but also Grassy Park, Nyanga, Langa and Gugulethu.

**Informed by the findings of the review of the PHA, the following recommendations are made:**

These recommendations are made up of three key themes, the first is a set of issues that need immediate resolution, second, is a set of needs that require further review and analysis and lastly, a set of potential alternative uses of the PHA have been included.

The issues that require immediate resolution include the following:

**The urban edge needs to be clearly defined and the PHA secured as an agricultural area:**

Resolution as to the extent of the urban edge in respect of the PHA is urgently required. Work to this effect is currently underway with a first draft for public comment expected in October 2012. This study, the Schaapkraal Smallholdings and Environs Urban Edge and Development Guidelines Study is essential and would assist greatly in resolving issues pertaining to illegal use and use encroachment. Once this project is complete, the urban edge should then be formalised and secured.

It needs to be stressed that while this is deemed a horticultural area, activities that result in successful horticultural activities fall within a broader agricultural remit. Thus, what is required is the cessation of non-agricultural activities and not non-horticultural activities. Such a response to the area would be counter-productive and limit the farmers’ viability. The City further needs to engage with farmers to better understand what kind of land-use regulations are useful for them and their particular economic and spatial constraints. A finer scale, more locally informed assessment of existing land use patterns needs to be considered. For example, all plots with transport on them are not alike, some are used to support the agricultural activities and are thus necessary, but others are simply used as scrap yards and even cheap parking areas for the film industry. The PHA is unique from an urban governance perspective and current rural zoning rules are not necessarily appropriate for the PHA/urban/agricultural context. Working with all farmers and agricultural stakeholders could
serve to assist in the generation of mutually agreeable and applicable land use and zoning regulations that are in the interest of all parties.

This process should then be followed up with a resolution and cessation of non-agricultural activities within the PHA and through a consultative process, timelines given for the elimination of these activates.

**All areas currently deemed to be viable and productive agriculture areas need to be retained for agriculture:**

The viability of productive agricultural land is critical to the broader food system of the city of Cape Town and as such, this land needs to be secured. Further, the challenges in input cost increases and climate related disasters that have been experienced in the region (drought in Eden District, severe flooding in Theewaterskloof region) all point to extreme climatic volatility. The PHA offers a measure of resilience, acting as an insurance policy to protect city residents from the consequences of these climate related events.

Further, the Cape Town food system is embedded within the global food system and global food related issues pose a real threat to the city and particularly the poor residents within the city. Recently, extreme events such as fires in the Russian Federation, resulting in wheat price volatility, flooding in the USA, resulted in significant lost crops and price increases. These price fluctuations place the residents of Cape Town at the whim of the market and while faith in other market mechanisms to address this are generally argued, recent global issues have disproved this (the role that food has been found to play in the Arab Spring, as one example).

Lastly, global food prices have recently passed those experienced in 2008 and are expected to continue rising. This coupled with the other threats place the citizens of Cape Town in an extremely vulnerable situation, one that currently has a cushion, namely the PHA, and should this no longer be accessible, this would place the city in extreme risk.

**The Departments of Agriculture and Rural Development need to be engaged and called on their lack of support for the farmers within the area:**

While this may be deemed to be extreme and others may wonder if in fact the support from these departments is required, they have a constitutional mandate and as such, a fiscal mandate, to support the area. This support needs to be directed at making the emerging farmers as sustainable as possible but also needs to be directed to supporting the broader PHA as a key agricultural asset. The recent placement of a DoAWC office in the PHA is recognised but this needs to be part of a far larger and engaged process of support, research and investment.

The PHA farmers are small in comparison to other farming typologies in South Africa but are highly successful in horticultural agriculture that is economically viable, highly intensified and responsive to the specific climatic, market and ecological context. These aspects make the PHA farmers the best suited and some of the most experienced farmers in the support of smallscale agriculture. With the current policy shifts and the focus on the development and support of smallscale agriculture, the PHA farmers are indispensable and potentially hold the key to the viability and success of the
smallholder programmes. For the success of the Zero Hunger Strategy and other such initiatives, the PHA farmers, large scale and emerging, are vital, key strategic partners; partners that need to be recognised for their experience, insights and value.

**Greater police visibility, resources and effort is required within the PHA:**

The nature of the police responses to the needs of all farmers and broader stakeholders within the PHA needs serious attention. Existing policing challenges notwithstanding, regardless of how effective zoning changes may be or the potential positive impact from required further support from the DoAWC and DRD&LR, these would be in vain if the area were not effectively policed. As an identified asset with multiple benefits accruing to a wide variety of citizens, not protecting the PHA would result in its ultimate demise. Further, if the PHA was removed from the Cape Town food system, it is argued this would result in an even greater safety and security challenge than those experienced currently, in the PHA area and the broader Cape Town environs. What is required is proactive and collaborative policing that assists in securing the area, and the current and future benefits that are, and will be, derived for all Capetonians from the area.

**Within the City, one specific governance structure should be given full responsibility for the PHA. In addition, an intergovernmental task team needs to be established, with full decision making mandate to support and coordinate activities within the PHA:**

City documentation in 2002 argued that “the different spheres of government generally have adequate legislation and policies in place to regulate rural land usage and ensure sustainable rural resource utilization. The problem experienced is a lack of consistency between different policies, a lack of capacity to enforce and implement, poor co-ordination between different authorities, and poor political commitment to the rural areas of Cape Town”\(^{40}\). However, currently in the case of the PHA, this is no longer the case. The policy and frameworks to protect the area are clear but a real challenge exists in specific competing land use needs within the city and the lack of relevant information that could support the protection of the area\(^{41}\). These issues are made all the more complex by varying priorities and perspectives within the different spheres of government and city departments on the value of the current PHA land use to the urban fabric.

This issue needs immediate resolution and effective management. One structure needs to be given full authority for the PHA and the challenge of coordination between the different spheres of government needs immediate resolution. Similar governance structures exist currently within the city, such as the City Improvement District structures, Mayoral task teams or potentially structures similar to the Coastal Management Branch.

**A process is required to facilitate a different perspective on how the PHA and other residential areas align and are managed and governed, through both policy and practice:**

The ongoing challenge associated with the PHA, the divergent views on its value, the challenges with policing and the fact that developers see this as an ideal opportunity for development raises

\(^{40}\) CoCT, RMF, 2002:6

\(^{41}\) Currently departure change decisions have to be made informed by existing information and data available to the city.
concerns as to the way in which the area is viewed, the management systems that are in place to protect it and the limitations placed on both residents and officials in how these areas are managed. Practices from other regions of the world could be reviewed to assess if in fact the current governance processes are in fact relevant in a changing city context. In other regions, different approaches are adopted:

The Japanese metropolitan edge / rural area offers an interesting experience of a dense intermixture of supposedly incompatible land uses, for example horticulture, industry, schools, housing, garages and offices, as well as a refreshing absence of social aggregation. This land use mix or mosaic reflects a distinctive cultural tradition, but is regarded as a failure by European and American planning criteria.

Instead the Japanese emphasize the positive aspects of a development philosophy based on expansion and on urban / rural mixture and regard it as a more useful and realistic prototype for the rapidly urbanizing and industrializing countries of Asia than the segregationist restrictive notions of land use planning embodied in the West.\(^2\)

While these may appear to offer opportunities, the appropriateness of these would need to be evaluated from a developmental, zoning, historical and cultural perspective. This challenge also speaks to a number of other conceptual challenges faced by the PHA. This research found that the PHA is of significant value but also found that regulations to ensure its protection and regulations to police use are arguably inappropriate in terms of contemporary urban governance. Alternative and arguably radical urban governance perspectives are required to mediate the different use requirements but also, to enable a set of policies that have a positive impact on the PHA.

**Alternative actions necessary in order to assist in more effective and robust governance of the PHA**

**Effective and proactive Land Reform interventions:**

The South African Land Reform process is falling well short of the 2014 targets. As certain farmers leave the PHA, due to small farm sizes and other market related challenges, new Black farmers could be provided with land in the area. The case of the existing new emerging farmers in the area offer insights into opportunities that could be unlocked through this process. The development of a cadre of new land reform urban farmers could play a positive role in changing land holding and thus enable effective land reform.

This transition however, would only be possible if effective and appropriate support and assistance is afforded to these farmers by the designated government departments. The struggles faced by the current emerging farmers need to be addressed and alternative support mechanisms put in place to enable this. The emerging farmers have seen themselves as the trail blazers in this regard and need to be consulted in order to develop proactive and innovative land development interventions.

---

\(^2\) Herbert, 1988, in CoCT, RMF, 2002:22
New market systems and governance structures need to be developed:

Linked to the above land reform potential, developing new farmers and then assuming that the current market options would be the most appropriate for them would be wrong. As evidenced by the new market networks developed by the emerging farmer group, new and alternative market opportunities should be considered.

This approach would require a fundamentally different perspective on the part of most in authority of the so called informal sector. This is the sector that supplies most of the daily food needs to the communities in the vicinity of the PHA and as such, these entities need effective and market relevant support.

This support would require very different forms of engagement and policy regimes. The current by-laws often serve to criminalise these groups and drive customers to inappropriate retail centres where the poor are unable to attain food that is appropriate or affordable (due generally to alternative sales regimes). The current mini mall model needs a fundamental review as this has been argued to be inappropriate to the needs most residents within the areas of most need 43.

Seeking out mechanisms and options to support and build a robust informal sector would serve both the potential land reform farmers with a market but provide appropriate access points to the communities that make the most use of these outlets.

Areas of review that require further review and analysis:

Significantly more information is required in order to effectively understand the role of the PHA in the broader food system and how this impacts on the various stakeholder groups reliant on this area both directly and indirectly.

This research process has only started to generate an understanding of the PHA area and the role that the PHA plays in the region. Making decisions about the area without this information would be irresponsible. Further while those stakeholders that benefit from the area are not fully understood, no systems are in place to support these citizens. The region is fortunate to have access to a number of research institutions, the CHEC university network, the ARC, the MRC and the CSIR. These groups should be approached and specific research requests made of these groups in order to generate the necessary data to fully understand the area. The area is currently misunderstood and as such, its importance to the region and the city is underestimated.

Identification and mobilising of groups that could actively participate in and support the PHA currently and into the future:

The role of civil society and in particular, the non-governmental organisations active in issues of land access, food security, social justice and other social and economic rights advocacy has not been addressed within this report. These groups have a critical role to play within the PHA and while there

43 Informed by three key factors: firstly, most of the entry level supermarkets have been found to be serving the second tier quintile and not the poorest residents within the city (Battersby, in press). This research found that only limited fresh produce was available at these outlets and the produce available (only potatoes, onions and tomatoes were reported) was of poor quality. Lastly, these outlets did not respond to customers buying needs – single items, credit at times, specials and specifically freshness.
may be certain differences of opinion as to what the future of the PHA may resemble (aligned to their own organisational mandates and imperatives), these groups need to be mobilised in order to firstly understand the net value of the PHA to all citizens within the city and secondly, to then assume a far greater responsibility for the attainment of an ultimate vision for the area.

These organisations have a specific and critical role to play in securing the area. They also have a key role to play in defining how the future of the area emerges and how the relationships between the PHA and its stakeholders are facilitated. These civil society groups need to become a voice for the voiceless.

Through the research process, the PHA was found to be an area of critical importance. Further, when the current and future challenges that the city will face are considered, the PHA is a key city asset. This understanding exists within the city as the 2007 statement in the heritage brochure demonstrates. While this statement was drafted over 5 years ago, it remains true today:

*The Philippi market garden is still active. It produces tons of vegetables and flowers annually for local consumption and export. It is labour-intensive and, a source of employment for the communities in the vicinity.*

*This distinctive farming landscape is unique in the city. It forms a large green lung within a dense urban environment. It provides a valuable resource for diverse employment opportunities, recreational enjoyment and cultural activities (CoCT, 2007:2).*

References


City of Cape Town, 2007. *Philippi Heritage information Brochure, City of Cape Town Heritage advice pamphlet #16.*

City of Cape Town, 2008. *Agricultural Land Report. Directorate of Planning, City of Cape Town*


City of Cape Town, 2012a. EESP Directorate. *Presentation on PHA to inform key decision making processes, April 2012.*


Republic of South Africa, 2012. Provincial Gazette 6951, Western Cape Province. Friday, 10 February 2012

Interviews:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Small Farmers</th>
<th>Commercial Farmers</th>
<th>Other stakeholders</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Holmes, at Agrimark Philippi</td>
<td>Philip Horstmann, at Marydale farm, 24 April.</td>
<td>Henk Conradie, Philippi AgriMark Manager AgriMark, 12 April.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jonathan, Boom Road</td>
<td>Leon Rix, at Geduld farm, 23 April.</td>
<td>Keir Hennesey, Planner City of Cape Town, at City offices, Plumstead, 13 April.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swart, 27 April.</td>
<td>Gunther Rix, at Groenevald plaas, 30 April.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George, 24 April.</td>
<td>Johan Boch, at Rietvlei Farm/Montagu Gift, 09 May 2012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pseudonyms used for the small farmers: questions pertaining to quoted remarks should be directed to the corresponding author